Current applications and efficacy of scleral contact lenses—a retrospective study

Boris Severinsky\textsuperscript{a,*,} and Michel Millodot\textsuperscript{b}

\textsuperscript{a}Ophthalmology Dept., Contact Lens Clinic, Hadassah University Hospital, Jerusalem, Israel
\textsuperscript{b}School of Optometry and Vision Science, Cardiff University, UK

Received 27 March 2010; accepted 13 August 2010

\textbf{Abstract}

\textbf{Purpose:} To evaluate the indications and efficacy of high gas permeable scleral contact lenses (GP-SCL).
\textbf{Methods:} A total database of 97 consecutive patients (140 eyes) fitted with GP-SCL between January 2003 and December 2008, was retrospectively analyzed to determine the benefits of fitting scleral lenses. All lenses were fitted by preformed technique and were non-fenestrated. Patients included keratoconus - 88 eyes (63%); corneal irregularities after penetrating keratoplasty - 39 eyes (28%); various ocular surface disorders: Stevens-Johnson syndrome (SJS), graft versus host disease (GVHD) and exposure keratopathy - 6 eyes (4%); post refractive surgery keratoectasia - 4 eyes (3%), and high refractive error - 3 eyes (2%).
\textbf{Results:} Mean follow up was 27.5 months (range 1-71), mean wearing time in successful wearers group was 12.2 hours per day (range 10-16), mean wearing time in group of wearers who dropped out using GP-SCL, was 5.8 hours (range 3-8). Keratoconus patients achieved median best corrected visual acuity (BCVA) of 20/32, 84% of patients achieved BCVA of 20/40 or more. The post keratoplasty group achieved median BCVA of 20/25, 92% of patients achieved BCVA of 20/40 or better. In the other groups, median BCVA was as follows: ocular surface disorders - 20/50, keratoectasia - 20/30, high refractive error - 20/32. Positive fluid-venting was highly associated with successful GP-SCL wearing. Twenty patients (21%) failed to wear GP-SCL.
\textbf{Conclusions:} GP-SCL’s expand the management of various corneal abnormalities. The main indication for GP-SCL is optical correction of an irregular corneal surface, especially keratoconus and corneal transplant.

© 2010 Spanish General Council of Optometry. Published by Elsevier España, S.L. All rights reserved.
Introduction

Thousands of people all over the world are considered legally blind or have very poor vision due to keratoconus, high or irregular astigmatism and other forms of corneal irregularities or dystrophies.

The concept of optically neutralizing the cornea with a lens which enclosed a liquid reservoir over the corneal front surface was proposed in 1508 by Leonardo da Vinci. Almost 400 years later Fick designed the earliest practical contact lenses, which were scleral lenses. His idea was to neutralize the optical effects of the corneal distortion for patients with irregular astigmatism by using afocal scleral glass shells.

Modern scleral lenses are indicated for several ocular conditions such as keratoconus and other primary corneal ectasia, post corneal transplant when residual high refractive error exists or the surface remains highly irregular, serious dry eye conditions and neurotrophic keratitis, and can nearly always be fitted successfully. These lenses offer two unique advantages.

Firstly, they are supported by the sclera and therefore can be fitted on eyes with markedly irregular corneas. This is particularly important for patients with corneal irregularity, when vision cannot be improved with rigid corneal contact lenses, either because of the patients' poor tolerance level or inability to fit such a lens.

Secondly, there is the constant aqueous reservoir between the lens and the cornea. This reservoir neutralizes most of the irregular astigmatism and protects the corneal surface from the desiccating effects of exposure to air and the friction of blinking. This is especially important in cases of non-healing corneal epithelial defects and other ocular surface diseases that cannot be resolved with other currently available therapeutic modalities.

Until the last decade of the past century, these advantages could not be fully realized because of chronic corneal hypoxia attributed to low gaseous permeability of polymethyl methacrylate (PMMA) and other materials from which the lenses were made. The development of rigid gas-permeable plastics greatly reduced the hypoxic complications associated with daily wear of corneal lenses and added a new dimension to the potential of scleral lenses for the visual rehabilitation of patients with markedly irregular corneas and treatment of ocular surface disorders. In 1983 Ezekiel described the use of preformed, fenestrated, silicone/ acrylic gas permeable scleral contact lenses in fitting patients with keratoconus, severe myopia, aphakia, and corneal scarring. Since then, new techniques in the manufacture of rigid gas-permeable scleral lenses have been developed.

In this article, we will report our experience in fitting patients with sealed non-fenestrated GP-SCL and assess the vision rehabilitation and therapeutic benefits in...
Corneal clearance
Optical zone
Transitional zone
Haptic surface
Cornea
Sclera

Figure 1  Fitting relationship of the scleral contact lens.

Figure 2  Fluorescein dye diffusion under the GP-SCL haptic into pre-corneal fluid reservoir.

the management of various corneal and ocular surface diseases.

Methods

Clinical data from the records of 97 consecutive patients (140 eyes), fitted with GP-SCL between January 2003 and December 2008, were retrospectively analyzed to determine the indications for lens fitting and visual outcomes.

Patients were referred to the contact lens clinic in Hadassah University Hospital, due to severe corneal irregularities or corneal surface disorders resistant to other therapeutic options. Patients referred for vision rehabilitation were unable to wear corneal rigid gas permeable (RGP) lenses or fitting of such lenses was contraindicated. Ocular pathologies included: keratoconus, keratoglobus and pellucid marginal degeneration (KC), corneal irregularity after penetrating keratoplasty (PKP), severe exposure keratopathy, Stevens-Johnson syndrome (SJS), graft versus host disease (GVHD) or other ocular surface disorders (OSD), corneal ectasia after refractive surgery and high refractive errors (HRE).

GP-SCL features

The lenses were lathed by City Crown Aspheric 7 CNC lathe (Microlens Ltd, Tel Aviv). Two highly gas permeable polymers were used: TYR-O-97 (Lagado Corp.) having a permeability Dk value of 97 × 10⁻¹⁰ cm² mL O₂/ sec mL mm Hg (International Organization for Standardization [ISO]/ Fatt) and Optimumpic (Contamac corp.) Dk value of 125 × 10⁻¹⁰ cm² mL O₂/ sec mL mm Hg (ISO/ Fatt) units.

Use of hyper-Dk/ t RGP lens materials (> 100 Dk/ t) have been shown to supply enough oxygen to the cornea in all day lens wearers, which does not compromise corneal health in terms of increased corneal swelling.¹³ Each scleral lens was preformed, non-fenestrated and sealed, with an overall diameter of 18.5 mm, designed to barely clear the highest point of the cornea and to provide the most uniform thickness profile of the fluid accumulated between the lens and the cornea. By maintaining the minimal thickness of this reservoir, we optimized the oxygen transmissibility of the lens-cornea system and minimized the degradation of vision that occurs if excessive tear debris accumulate inside this reservoir during lens wear. The thickness of this profile ranged between one third of corneal thickness and 300-400 μm. The curvature of the central back surface of each lens (optic zone) was chosen to maintain a shallow, but definite clearance of the cornea and limbus, thus the lens was entirely supported by the sclera. Corneal clearance was evaluated by slit lamp examination to establish the optimal sagittal height of each lens.

In an average lens, the internal optic zone of 12.5 mm was a single curve surrounded by a 1.5-2.0 mm wide transitional zone vaulting the limbus and merging seamlessly into the posterior haptic surface (Figure 1). The haptic parameters of individual lenses were determined by observing the vascular compression patterns of the bulbar conjunctiva, using a series of diagnostic lenses of different haptic designs aimed at minimizing lens induced compression of conjunctival blood vessels and enabling unobstructed blood circulation. The average center thickness of the lenses was 0.35 mm.

Fluorescein fluid-venting test

After the lens had been placed on the eye with sterile saline and had been in position for at least 2 hours, fluorescein dye was installed. After 5 minutes, a slit lamp examination with cobalt blue filter or optic section was performed.⁴,⁵,¹⁴ In cases when fluorescein diffused under the lens haptic and reached the pre-corneal liquid chamber independently or by gentle palpation, the test was considered positive (Figure 2) if no fluorescence was seen—the test was considered negative.

Indications for success/failure

We considered the fitting of GP-SCL to be successful when wearing time of 10 hours a day or more, with no lens adhesion on removal, was reached. Partial success was defined as ability to wear the lenses between 6 to 10 hours a day. Wearing of GP-SCL less then 6 hours a day was considered to be a failure.

Results

A total of 97 patients (140 eyes) included 29 females (30%) and 68 males (70%), the patients’ ages ranged between 16-77 years. Mean follow up was 27.5 months (range 1-71).

Indications

The primary clinical indications for GP-SCL could be categorized in three main categories: vision improvement...
Current applications and efficacy of scleral contact lenses—a retrospective study

The most common diagnoses for use of GP-SCL was keratoconus (KC) - 88 eyes (63 %), followed by extreme corneal irregularities or high astigmatism after penetrating keratoplasty (PKP) - 39 eyes (28 %). Other indications included various ocular surface disorders (OSD) - 6 eyes (4 %): 2 eyes with corneal stem cell disorder (Steven-Johnson syndrome), 2 eyes with severe dry eye syndrome due to GVHD, 1 eye was treated for severe exposure keratopathy and 1 eye had post herpetic keratitis.

Four eyes (3 %) were fitted with GP-SCL for post refractive surgery keratoectasia (2 eyes PRK, 2 eyes LASIK); 3 eyes (2 %) fitted due to high refractive errors: 2 eyes were aphakic and 1 eye had high myopia with spherical equivalent of — 16.00 diopter.

Efficacy

Eighty eight of the 134 eyes that were fitted primarily to improve vision had keratoconus. Another 39 eyes were fitted due to inadequate spectacle-corrected vision after successful penetrating keratoplasty. Some of those eyes had undergone multiple unsuccessful surgical procedures for reducing the iatrogenic astigmatism. In most of these cases, the scleral lens provided useful corrected vision, regardless of the amount or type of corneal astigmatism present.

Median visual acuity (VA) with GP-SCL was 20/32 (Snellen fraction) and ranged from 20/400 to 20/20. The median best spectacle corrected VA without a contact lens was 20/70 (range 20/800-20/30). There was a significant increase in VA with scleral lenses compared to the best spectacle corrected VA (P < 0.001, signed rank test).

Improvement in best-corrected visual acuity (BCVA), defined as a gain of two or more decimal acuity lines, was observed in 125 eyes (93 %) out of the 134 eyes treated for vision improvement.

Visual outcomes varied according to the preexisting ocular status. The best visual results were obtained in the post PKP group, which achieved 20/40 or more in 92% of cases with median BCVA of 20/25. Eyes in the keratoconus group achieved 20/40 or more in 84% of cases with median BCVA of 20/32. In other groups, median BCVA was as follows: OSD 20/50, keratoectasia 20/30, HRE 20/32 (Table 1).

During the period of study 102 eyes (73 %) were successfully fitted, as defined by success criteria, i.e. able to wear the lenses for more than 10 hours a day, and 15 eyes (11 %) achieved partial success with GP-SCL. Mean wearing time of successful wearers was 12.2 hours a day (range 10-16). The mean wearing time among all fitted patients was 11 hours a day (ranged 5-16). Wearing times of the treated groups are shown in Figure 3.

Seventy eight eyes (77 %) in the successful wearers group had positive fluorescein dye test (Table 2). Fluorescein dye penetration under the lens haptic, i.e. positive fluid-venting was highly associated with successful GP-SCL wearing, (P = 0.0007, chi-square test)

Twenty patients (21 %) failed to wear GP-SCL. Mean wearing time in this group was 5.8 hours a day (range 3-8).

Table 1: Best visual acuity and average wearing time achieved with GP-SCL fitted for various conditions and range

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Condition</th>
<th>N (%)</th>
<th>≥ 20/40</th>
<th>&lt; 20/40 to ≥ 20/200</th>
<th>&lt; 20/200</th>
<th>Mean wearing time (range)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>KC</td>
<td>88 (63)</td>
<td>74 (53)</td>
<td>14 (10)</td>
<td>0 (—)</td>
<td>11.9 (5-16)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Post-PKP</td>
<td>39 (28)</td>
<td>36 (26)</td>
<td>3 (2)</td>
<td>0 (—)</td>
<td>12.2 (8-16)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>OSD</td>
<td>6 (4)</td>
<td>2 (1.5)</td>
<td>3 (2)</td>
<td>1 (1)</td>
<td>9.3 (5-14)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Others</td>
<td>7 (5)</td>
<td>3 (2)</td>
<td>4 (3)</td>
<td>0 (—)</td>
<td>9.1 (6-12)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>140 (100.0)</td>
<td>115 (82)</td>
<td>24 (17)</td>
<td>1 (1)</td>
<td>11 (5-16)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

KC: keratoconus; OSD: ocular surface disease; PKP: penetrating keratoplasty.

Table 2: Fluorescein fluid-venting in successful and failed wearers

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Successful</th>
<th>Failed</th>
<th>Total</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Positive fluorescein test</td>
<td>78 (56%)</td>
<td>17 (12%)</td>
<td>95 (68%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Negative fluorescein test</td>
<td>24 (17%)</td>
<td>21 (15%)</td>
<td>45 (32%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>102 (73%)</td>
<td>38 (27%)</td>
<td>140 (100%)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
and mean drop-out period was 5.1 month. Seven successfully fitted patients (7%) dropped-out wearing GP-S CL due to further penetrating keratoplasty procedure (mean follow up 16.8 month).

**Discussion**

This retrospective review shows that medical applications of GP-S CL include both visual and therapeutic uses for a range of complicated corneal and ocular surface conditions for which treatment by other methods is either unsuitable or less effective.

Diagnoses may be categorized into four main groups: primary or induced keratoectasia, post penetrating keratoplasty, ocular surface diseases and high refractive errors. In the current study, patients with keratoconus and other forms of irregular corneal surface formed the largest group (63%), followed by post penetrating keratoplasty iatrogenic astigmatism group (28%), and ocular surface disorders group (4%).

Vision improvement was the primary indication for GP-S CL in nearly 95% of the fitted eyes, and was achieved in most instances by neutralizing the corneal irregularities or correcting existing refractive errors.

Visual outcomes varied according to the preexisting ocular status. The best visual results were obtained in the post keratoplasty group, which achieved 20/40 or better in 92% of cases. These patients were fitted with GP-S CL to correct post PKP corneal astigmatism or corneal irregularities, induced by transplant misalignment.

The patients suffering from keratoconus had severe forms of the disease leading to failure with corneal contact lenses or were unable to tolerate wearing this type of lenses. They were fitted with GP-S CL as the last alternative before surgery. Visual outcomes obtained in this group showed significant improvement of visual acuity, 20/40 or better in 84% of patients.

Keratoconus patients are commonly adolescents, and may require corneal surgery during their lifetime. The risks associated with the keratoplasty procedure, which include infection, rejection, and severe astigmatism, may be greater than those attributed to GP-S CL wear.

**Comparison with previous studies**

Various evaluation methods of GP-S CL performance demonstrate different results, thus it is difficult to make direct comparisons between studies. Since the first successful application of gas-permeable scleral lenses by Ezekiel in 1983, several studies have been published. The study designs varied in size, diagnoses, fitting methods, scleral lens types and materials. However, as in our study the most common indication was keratoconus, followed by post keratoplasty. The large retrospective studies of Pullum and Buckley and Rosenthal and Croteau on 530 and 538 patients, respectively, included a host of clinical indications but keratoconus and post penetrating keratoplasty still comprised the two largest groups. However in a study carried out in the early nineties, Tan et al. reported keratoconus as the most common condition requiring scleral lenses followed by aphakia and then post keratoplasty. Lenses used varied greatly in size from 15 mm to 23mm. Schornack and Patel used a scleral lenses with an overall diameter of 18.2 mm, which is similar to the lenses used in our study (18.5 mm). They suggested that lenses that are supported by the sclera and clear both the cornea and limbus could be defined as 'scleral' lenses irrespective of the actual overall diameter.

The characteristics of our patients and our results were similar to those reported by other studies regarding visual rehabilitation. Our study confirmed the best acuity results achieved in patients with irregular or severe astigmatic topography. Studies that included indications other than visual correction, treatment of ocular surface disease for example, showed less marked improvement in VA.

The reason of lower visual results is primarily therapeutic indication for scleral lens fitting i.e. corneal protection, tear conservation, or pain relief.

**Success rate**

Development of scleral lenses with a smoother continuous back surface that follows more precisely the underlying scleral surface has made prolonged, comfortable scleral lens wear possible. Penetration of liquids under the lens in situ, i.e. positive fluid-venting was found to be associated with successful fit and increased wearing time.

Moreover, the combination of high oxygen permeability and favorable tear exchange allowed by the lens back geometry may diminish the incidence of complications such as corneal edema or lens adhesion.

Failure rates during the period of our study were 21%. This number concurs with the results of other investigations. In a retrospective study, Tan et al. found that 71% of the eyes could continue wearing the scleral lens, Pullum and Buckley described that 22% of their cases failed a scleral trial or stopped wearing their scleral lenses completely. Failure rate of 10.4% was reported by Segal et al., while Schornack and Patel reported that 12 out of 32 patients (38%) decided not to pursue scleral lens wear after initial evaluation.

In conclusion, modern scleral contact lenses can be used successfully for visual rehabilitation and management of a wide range of corneal disorders that have not responded adequately to other treatments. The main indication for GP-S CL is optical correction of an irregular corneal surface, especially due to keratoconus and post corneal transplant. In the keratoconus group, GP-S CL serves as an alternative to surgery. In the post-PKP group GP-S CL provided an alternative to refractive surgery or repeated corneal transplantation. Scleral lenses were found beneficial in several forms of ocular surface diseases. Therapeutic benefits of GP-S CL enhance the management of ocular surface diseases when medical treatments have failed and surgery is undesirable.

**Conflict of interest**

The authors have no proprietary, financial or commercial interest in any material or method mentioned in this study.
References